UNESCO-APEID Consultation Meeting on Entrepreneurship Education
*A Supportive Ecosystem for Entrepreneurship Education in Universities*
9-10 February 2015, Bangkok, Thailand

Organized by
UNESCO Asia and Pacific Regional Bureau for Education, Bangkok, Thailand

Report of the Meeting

1. Welcome by Mr. Gwang-Jo Kim, Director, UNESCO Bangkok

About 200 million people were unemployed in 2013, with 74.5 million being young people between 15-24 years old. The global youth unemployment rate reached 13.1 %, which is almost three times higher than adult unemployment rate. Recent reports noted that the economy is improving, but young people are still having a difficult time finding good jobs.

A new type of economy is emerging with complex systems and relationships. Technology and innovation have resulted in more automation replacing the human workforce. The mismatch between knowledge and skills being taught and what are required in the workplace is another concern. Fundamental changes are needed and entrepreneurship education is garnering substantial interest from many countries as a solution to these issues.

UNESCO organized an international conference on creativity and entrepreneurship in Jakarta in 2011, followed by 2 meetings in Hangzhou China in 2012 and 2013, respectively. The 3rd meeting on entrepreneurship education was held in Kuala Lumpur in 2013 where the UNESCO Entrepreneurship Education Network (EE-Net) was launched. Entrepreneurship education is not just about helping young people start a business or create jobs, but also about changing mindsets, behaviours, attitudes and so on. The EE-Net has National Chapters in 5 countries (China, Indonesia, Malaysia, Philippines and Sri Lanka) and focal points in India and Pakistan.

This consultation meeting aimed to develop a research framework for a study about the ecosystem to support entrepreneurship education in universities in 9 countries as shown below:

- **South Asia:** India, Pakistan, Sri Lanka
- **Southeast Asia:** Indonesia, Malaysia, Philippines
- **East Asia:** China (+ Hong Kong), Japan, Republic of Korea

Hopefully the framework will address three key areas:

1. Building / stumbling blocks for entrepreneurship ecosystem
2. Actions to be taken by multiple stakeholders to address these barriers
3. Role(s) of education to promote entrepreneurship

Through education, good practices and successes can be replicated and scaled up. They can contribute to the post 2015 UN agenda on sustainable development. By helping school leavers and unemployed adults brush up their skills to participate actively in the labour market, universities can play a huge role in promoting lifelong learning.
2. Brief overview of entrepreneurship education in each country

Representatives from the 9 countries participating in the research study provided a brief overview of the entrepreneurship education in their respective countries, particularly in the following areas:

1. Current status of entrepreneurship education (EE) in their country
2. Key issues facing EE in their country
3. Major elements of the ecosystem in universities that need more research and support in their country

The information will be included and expanded in their respective research studies.

China:
- The government has exerted much effort to promote entrepreneurship education (EE) since 1998.
- In 2002, the MOE nominated 9 universities as pilot universities to implement EE.
- In 2010, the MOE issued a circular on promoting EE in higher education institutions, accompanied by a systematic guidance about EE.
- Many courses have been developed to support EE.
- Science parks and entrepreneurship parks were established.
- Seed funding from universities and government have been set up and students can apply for grants to fund their EE activities, e.g., Shanghai Technology Foundation.
- Even though EE has a 15-year history, development of EE is still in infancy.
- Key issues identified:
  - How to improve organisation structure of EE?
  - How to develop/diversify the curriculum?
  - How to nurture entrepreneurship faculty?
  - How to promote entrepreneurship culture?
  - How to build effective relationship between government and university

Hong Kong:
- Students have limited exposure to industries, and they lack experience in writing business plans and management skills, a disadvantage when writing proposals to seek government funding. The Chief Executive of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region noted in his Policy Address on 14 January 2015 that partnerships between business and schools need to be strengthened to enhance students’ understanding of different trades and prepare them for their future employment through workplace orientation and visits, mentorship and career experience programmes. A $300 million Youth Development Fund has been set up to support innovative activities including matching funds for NGOs to assist young people in starting their own businesses. The IPASS and youth section within the Hong Kong government website also contains relevant information, e.g. the Youth Business Hong Kong provides financial access for business start-ups and mentoring.
- There is a need to bridge gaps between bachelor and master degree programmes.
- Entrepreneurship education is available at different levels and areas: business and management, creative and cultural areas, and under the Centre of Entrepreneurship or Institute for Entrepreneurship of major universities in Hong Kong. In addition, there is a growth of top-up degree programmes – from 70 in 2011/12 to 128 in 2013/14.
- To enrich the curriculum: capitalize on the creative cultural industries in Hong Kong, e.g. the development of Hong Kong's film industry, as evident in a new programme offering Bachelor of Arts (Hons) in Creative Writing for Film, Television and New Media (top-up).

India:
- Mainstreaming of EE happened in the last couple of years.
- EE is not embedded into the curriculum but efforts/promotions have started at the federal and state levels.
• Responsibility for EE has been transferred from the Ministry of Human Resources and Development to the new Ministry of Skill and Entrepreneurship Development, representing a big shift and game-changer.
• The focus is on 3 major pillars:
  - Curriculum/programme development
  - Infrastructure
  - Capacity building
• There are about 60,000-65,000 higher education institutions, but only 30-40% have EE programmes or courses.
• Job creation, linkage of the programmes and start-up culture feature dominantly in the EE landscape.
• MOOCs can increase access to EE.
• There is a need for more awareness raising of the potential of EE - big gap in mindsets despite progress being made.
• There is not enough concerted efforts to develop EE training programmes.
• Experiential exposure and learning is critical since entrepreneurship cannot be taught formally like other courses.
• Funding/infrastructure for EE needs substantial attention, including finding business incubators and so on.
• Impact measurement – insufficient evidence to support EE; also need to increase the understanding about the influence of enablers – government, industry, investors, policy-makers, mentors: insufficient/organised data in these areas.

Indonesia:
• Mindset – people prefer to be civil servants rather than entrepreneurs due to concerns about job insecurity and fear of risks.
• It is a challenge to educate and change their perspectives especially since there is a lack of support.
• EE has been integrated into curriculum, teaching students and SMEs how to run their businesses.
• Universities have a 3+1 format (3 years in university and 1 year working in the industry)
• Binus University has set up entrepreneurship centres and incubators.

Japan:
• There are more than 700 universities in Japan, but only about 200 institutions offer EE courses.
• The structure of the university system makes it difficult for students to take courses in other departments.
• Frequent changes to university management personnel also impede continuity of the programmes, and therefore support is not sustainable.
• Entrepreneurs and people working in the industries are invited to be guest lecturers.
• Compared to 10 years ago, the situation is much better with increasing governmental support, but at the institutional level, promoting EE is still a challenge.

Malaysia:
• The government’s vision is for Malaysia to be a developed country by 2020, and as such, innovation, creativity and entrepreneurial spirit are seen as the driving forces.
• In 2010, the Ministry of Education introduced a policy on entrepreneurship education in higher education institutions – which include universities, polytechnic colleges and community colleges – to produce graduates with entrepreneurial mindsets who can create jobs.
• To provide an entrepreneurial learning experience for students, universities in Malaysia are encouraged to offer a ‘3+1’ and/or a ‘2+2’ format which will allow students to spend three/two years in their educational institutions or one/two years working in the industries, with a priority on SMEs rather than big companies.
• Students entering HEIs are also assessed to measure their entrepreneurial attributes and intentions. Those with high entrepreneurial potential are directed to EE programmes.
• The many initiatives undertaken under the policy has successfully increased the student enrolment in entrepreneurship programmes: 16% (2011) to 34% (2014).
• Nonetheless, there is a lack of entrepreneurship attributes among top management and academic staff, with subsequent lack of policies to support student businesses and pursuits.
• Entrepreneurship is often not a career of choice for the students. The percentage of graduates who are self-employed has increased from 1% to 2%, and the goal is to increase this to 5% in 2015.
• The Malaysian Blueprint, which will be released in April 2015, will include the production of entrepreneurial students.

Pakistan:
• In 1947, there were only 2 universities in Pakistan. The first private university was established in 1983. In 2014, the number grew to 80 public universities and 80-90 private universities.
• The formalization of EE is still missing in Pakistan.
• Competitions for business plans are popular, but they are limited since they do not lead to the implementation of the plans.
• The first university incubation centre was set up in 2007, and has spread to 7-8 other universities: students can join the incubation for 6 months, demonstrate their progress and potential for scalability.
• There is no formal venture funds, but in 2010, the government set up Plan 9 to support incubation projects.
• Universities have started to introduce EE courses, but there is still no degree programmes for entrepreneurship.

Philippines:
• EE was introduced in the mid-1990s as an elective subject of business administration, but later the Commission of Higher Education separated EE from business programmes, with a focus on competencies rather than skills.
• There is not enough support and resources for EE in the Philippines.
• About 115 institutions are offering BSc or Masters in entrepreneurship in the country, but the high tuition fees mean that it is accessible only to the more affluent population.
• In the rural areas, universities focus on agri- and aqua-businesses.
• The Technical Education and Skills Development Authority (TESDA) has programmes targeted at out-of-school and unemployed people – more in line with small-scale business and livelihood programmes.
• Professional training for educators are mainly in the form of seminars and conferences, without any formal training programmes. There is a need to develop a competency framework for teachers.
• There is insufficient teaching materials and models – apart from western models. ASEAN/Asian models would be more appropriate.

Korea:
• The government is pushing forward with creative economy policies, including a national agenda to encourage start-ups.
• For a long time students tend to steer away from entrepreneurship towards more secured jobs in big companies like Samsung and LG.
• Almost all universities have adopted EE but there is not much follow-up action. Most programmes where available are classroom-based with little exposure to the industries.
• The fear of failure is a big issue and a stigma that remains for a long time. There is a great need to enhance the ecosystem in universities to support EE to change the mindsets.
• A wide gap in the perception of entrepreneurship exists between university staff/experts and students, and a bottom-up approach enabling student input complemented by successful role models and examples will be helpful.
Sri Lanka:

- 5 out of 17 public universities have introduced entrepreneurship degree programmes.
- The undergraduate programme is introduced by the Faculty of Management with no input from other faculties. The courses focus mainly on business studies.
- Students do not seem to be motivated to be entrepreneurs, displaying an aversion to failure and risk taking. They are more interested in getting a salaried job.
- The goal is to train corporate entrepreneurs and promote innovation, with less emphasis on independent entrepreneurs.
3. Models / Examples of Frameworks

Source: SEAANZ White Paper. Growing and sustaining entrepreneurial ecosystems: what they are and the role of government policy

Adapted from Mason and Brown (2014)
TABLE 1.1 SOCIAL, CULTURAL, POLITICAL AND ECONOMIC CONTEXT AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT PHASES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Economic development phases</th>
<th>From other available sources</th>
<th>From GEM National Expert Survey (NES)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Basic requirements—key to factor-driven economies</td>
<td>Institutions</td>
<td>Entrepreneurial Framework Conditions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Efficiency enhancers—key to efficiency-driven economies</td>
<td>Higher education and training</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Innovation and sophistication factors—key to innovation-driven economies</td>
<td>Business sophistication</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Global Entrepreneurship Monitor, 2014

GEM’s Key Entrepreneurial Framework Conditions

1. **Entrepreneurial Finance.** The availability of financial resources—equity and debt—for small and medium enterprises (SMEs) (including grants and subsidies).

2. **Government Policy.** The extent to which public policies support entrepreneurship. This EFC has two components:
   2a. Entrepreneurship as a relevant economic issue and
   2b. Taxes or regulations are either size-neutral or encourage new and SMEs.

3. **Government Entrepreneurship Programs.** The presence and quality of programs directly assisting SMEs at all levels of government (national, regional, municipal).

4. **Entrepreneurship Education.** The extent to which training in creating or managing SMEs is incorporated within the education and training system at all levels. This EFC has two components:
   4a. Entrepreneurship Education at basic school (primary and secondary) and
   4b. Entrepreneurship Education at post-secondary levels (higher education such as vocational, college, business schools, etc.).

5. **R&D Transfer.** The extent to which national research and development will lead to new commercial opportunities and is available to SMEs.

6. **Commercial and Legal Infrastructure.** The presence of property rights, commercial, accounting and other legal and assessment services and institutions that support or promote SMEs.

7. **Entry Regulation.** This EFC contains two components:
   7a. Market Dynamics: the level of change in markets from year to year, and
   7b. Market Openness: the extent to which new firms are free to enter existing markets.

8. **Physical Infrastructure.** Ease of access to physical resources—communication, utilities, transportation, land or space—at a price that does not discriminate against SMEs.

9. **Cultural and Social Norms.** The extent to which social and cultural norms encourage or allow actions leading to new business methods or activities that can potentially increase personal wealth and income.

Source: Global Entrepreneurship Monitor, 2014
4. Research Framework / Outline for Ecosystem to Support EE in Universities

- **Introduction**
  - Definitions of ecosystem, higher education institutions in this study
  - Characteristics of EE, importance of EE, status of entrepreneurship in the country
  - Economic considerations, including labour market projection and how to use EE to fill the gap

- **Objectives** - 5 key questions when carrying out research (who why when what how) and targeted audiences (academic institutions - primary audience), policy makers, stakeholders, students
  - Identify problems, challenges/building blocks/stumbling blocks for EE
  - Promote importance of EE in relation to different stakeholders
  - Identify areas / opportunities for youth engagement
  - Establish baseline of EE in participating countries and AP region
  - Formulate recommendations to support EE in the AP region

- **Scope of study**
  - National level, supplemented by cases at the provincial / institutional level
  - Japan – provincial level – emphasis on social entrepreneurship
  - China – include Hong Kong as case study

- **Methodology/modality of research**
  - Dependent on objectives, target groups - desk study, survey/questionnaires, interviews, etc. (check GEM and OECD reports)
  - Establish some common parameters, e.g.:
    ✓ universities offering EE degrees – bachelor, masters, diplomas, certificate
    ✓ no. of students enrolled in EE programmes, no. of EE graduates
    ✓ no. of EE teachers / trainers
    ✓ ???

- **Areas of focus**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Key issues</th>
<th>Resources – teaching staff, materials, funding, resource people</th>
<th>Recommendations - policies / measures</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 1. | **Macro-level**
  - policies / strategic plans – government and institution levels
  - environment
  - country context | | |
| 2. | **Curriculum and extra-curricular activities**
  - embedding entrepreneurship and innovation across multiple disciplines
  - fostering creativity / innovation
  - changing mindsets, values, attitudes, emotional development
  - engagement with industries | | |


3. Staff development / teacher training / capacity building / pedagogies / technologies to use, etc.

4. Assessment systems (for students) and auditing of EE programmes

5. Leadership – government, institution, private sector, community, students

6. Supportive environment / mechanisms
   - institutional/infrastructural environment
   - counselling services
   - incubators, business, angels, start-ups
   - competitions
   - commercialization of R&D innovations
   - etc.

7. Linkages with industries – internship, placement services, etc. (re curriculum or supportive environment)

8. Partnerships / networks
   - Networks such as NEN, consortium of universities, with private sector, communities, etc.

- Conclusions and recommendations

**Other matters related to research**

a. Resources needed for the study
   - Seed funding for research work available but need proposals (including budget) and signed contract
   - Every author need to sign Permission Consent Form regarding use of materials, references, graphs, diagrams, etc.

b. Roles and responsibilities of UNESCO and research institutions / researchers
   - UNESCO is the secretariat – coordinate with country research teams
   - Country’s responsibility – identify lead researcher/contact person, conduct research, write report and finalize report based on feedback from peer reviewers

c. Timeline
   - Outcomes of the meeting + framework to circulated before end of February
   - If seeking funding, proposal to reach UNESCO in early March, but preparation can start immediately
- Draft report (30-50 pages excluding references and annexes on A4 paper, single line, Times New Roman, Font size 11) to be submitted to UNESCO by end of June 2015, following UNESCO publication guidelines
- Present preliminary findings at 4th EE Meeting (in August / Sept)
- Finalize report by end of October

d. Research design
- Flexibility in detailed research methodology, but information and analysis should match outline above

e. Other references
- Jamil Goheer’s questionnaire (as attached) and NEN’s model (forthcoming)
- OECD Entrepreneurship at a Glance reports.

5. The 4th UNESCO-APEID Meeting on Entrepreneurship Education

The government of Sri Lanka has offered to host the 4th meeting, tentatively set for August 2015. However, in view of the change of government, UNESCO will communicate with the University Grants Commission in Sri Lanka to check if this is still on their agenda.

In case the Sri Lanka government is unable to host the event, potential hosts / venues are sought as listed below:

- Japan: colleagues from Ritsumeikan University will consult with other colleagues in Japan (focal points: Masaki Kuroki and Otieno Francis)
- Indonesia: a possibility is to combine this with the SME conference to be held in November 2015 (focal point: Idris Gautama So)
- Korea: to be explored (focal point: Park Tong)
- Philippines: August is not a good time due to the typhoon season (focal point Tony Lopez)
- Thailand: last resort (focal point: UNESCO Bangkok)

The EE-Net Secretariat will seek confirmation from Sri Lanka immediately, and country focal points will explore the possibility of hosting the event. We hope to have a decision by end of February.

6. Strengthening UNESCO EE-Net

a. Online EE-Net platform:
- Membership of the EE-Net platform [www.unesco-eenet.org](http://www.unesco-eenet.org) is open to all and not restricted to profession, status, geographical location, etc. To facilitate a more dynamic and interactive forum, EE-Net members have volunteered to moderate the EE-Net forum on a monthly basis as listed below:
  - March: Jamil Goheer
  - April: Idris Gautama So
  - May: Tony Lopez (Philippines National Chapter)
  - June: Joyeeta Das (NEN)

b. EE-Net newsletter
- Similarly, EE-Net members will volunteer to be the editor of the quarterly EE-Net newsletter, with Shirley Yeung offering her services for the March issue. All upcoming events can be included in the newsletter, and members are encouraged to send the information to the secretariat.
c. Potential joint activities: The following are suggestions for joint developments, and further discussions will be needed.

- Standardized curriculum and MOOCs (focal points: Philippines and Malaysia National Chapters)
- Collection and sharing of stories written by students from different countries (focal points: Shirley Yeung and Idris Gautama So)
- Database of entrepreneurs and online mentors (Members to identify and send info to Secretariat)

f. Other matters arising
- UNESCO accepts interns and volunteers, and a Masters student from Zhejiang University, China, will join UNESCO in March 2015 for 6 months as an intern.