Country Report

Pakistan

Brief Situation Analysis of CLC

1. Establishment and expansion of CLCs in the country
   1.1. National policies and strategies of CLCs

Commitment to adult literacy has always been a part of education policies in Pakistan. Education policy of 1972 and 1979, laid particular emphasis on adult literacy. In 1981, a Literacy and Mass Education Commission was established to promote literacy. In the mid-1980s, to provide incentives to literacy, a number of measures were proposed which were provided with a legal cover by Literacy Ordinance #XXVII of 1985, promulgated by the President of Pakistan. These measures included a ban on issuing of passports, and driving and arms license to illiterate persons as well as a ban on their recruitment in federal cadres. The Ordinance was approved by the Parliament in 1987 but was never enforced as its date of enforcement was to be later decided by the Government, which never happened. National Education Policy 1992, pledged to achieve a literacy target of 70% by 2002.

Literacy policy of 1998-2010 aimed at democratization of education through the expansion of elementary education including formal and non-formal methods and expanded programmes of adult education, literacy and functional literacy programmes, as a basic requirement for economic development, modernization of social structure and for providing equal opportunity for all citizens.

The salient features of the policy provisions in respect of literacy and non-formal education are as follows:
1. Establishment of an organization for the enforcement of minimum quality standards for AL certification; so that literacy skill may be provided as per specific set standard
2. Development of certification and equivalence for mainstreaming.
3. Linkages of NFE with industry, internship program, schools and vocational/skills program
4. A system to be developed for mainstreaming.
5. Bringing of working children within the ambit of NFE
6. Use of schools building for post initiative
7. Special literacy program for child labour.
8. Govt. developing guideline for post literacy initiative.
9. Regular follow-up literacy program

Strategies

This was to be achieved by complementing the formal primary school system with a strong non-formal basic education initiative. A massive non formal basic education programme is included in the plan to provide access economically and expeditiously to all the 6.850 million out of school primary school-age children. Adolescents and youth who have missed primary education are to be given a second chance through a crash condensed course to enable them to complete the primary education cycle within 2-3 years.
A number of measures are being undertaken by GOP to provide literacy for adults, especially for women. Under the President’s Education Sector Reforms programme an amount of Rupees 100 million has been allocated annually since 2001-02 for opening adult literacy centers in the provinces.

The Literacy Initiative for Empowerment (LIFE) has been launched in collaboration with UNESCO in 2006. First national curriculum for literacy has been developed and launched. The curriculum covers the areas of basic literacy (3 levels), functional literacy and income-generating skills.

Work on CLCs starts with community mobilization and awareness sessions; the community is made to understand that they could help improve their own lives through knowledge and skills. The CLC Program begins with the purpose of helping people, and so attempts to identify their real problems. With the aim of enabling communities to learn new knowledge and literacy skills, the CLCP initiates a multipurpose program; community involvement, life skill, business skills as per area needs.

CLCs are usually set up and managed by community people with active outside support to provide various learning opportunities and to generate grassroots-based interest and participation in literacy and continuing education, especially for the disadvantaged and poor.

Since a CLC aims at enhancing education level of a community by catering to the needs of dropout and enabling them to continue their education by improving their knowledge of basic compulsory subjects and encouraging life long and continuous learning; it therefore have equivalent education and certification programs and offers equivalent basic education programs and other life skills course.

To facilitate the process of learning and in order to make up the lost time phonetic method of teaching Urdu/basic English is used in some of the CLCs; also basic concept of arithmetic are clarified by linking it to their daily life situation and building upon the learners already gained knowledge. Linkages facility with government education institutions is also provided so that learners could be mainstreamed if they so desire

1.2 Objectives and target groups of CLCs:

Pakistan’s CLC is defined as a place, institution, or center for accessing knowledge, information, and literacy skills. Its purpose is to promote human development by providing opportunities for lifelong learning to all people in the local community. CLCs support empowerment, social transformation and improvement of the quality of life of the people.

The main functions of CLCs are to provide:

- Education and training,
- Community information and resource services,
- Community development activities,
- Co-ordination and networking
- Employment opportunity to make them partners in social progress.

Thus the goals of the CLCs are capacity building of the poor allowing them sustainable access to the employment opportunity for improvement of their quality of life.

The major focus of literacy programmes in Pakistan is on the female population. More that 80% of literacy centers are for women. A number of development programs and projects have been launched since 2000 for the promotion of girls’ primary education and female literacy.

1.3 Number of CLCs

In an effort to improve the level of literacy; a number of adult literacy and NFE program are being implemented by the Government and by NGOs. It has been realized now that communities would not be able to move from a basic literacy programme to a continuing education without an infrastructure of CLCs; so CLC-program is implemented in many communities. So far, around 50,000 CLCs have been implemented in 114 districts of the country.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CLCs/ multi learning program/ Government/ NGO/others</th>
<th>NO.s of dist./areas</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>50000</td>
<td>114 districts</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

These CLCs have the following components:

1) Basic Literacy Program (BLP)
The CLCP launched the BLP to educate people who are not able to read, write and do simple calculations. After completion, neo-literates may then proceed to the post-literacy programs.

2) Post-Literacy Program (PLP)
Post-literacy programs have been conducted to respond to the diverse needs of communities’ learners. The main objectives here are to upgrade basic skills such as reading, writing and simple calculating skills; to impart education for illiterate adults, adolescents and out-of-school children; and to provide literacy services for improving the neo-literates and learners’ literacy skills.

3) Continuing Education (CE)
In addition to basic and post-literacy programs, the CLCP also deliver continuing education and other community development activities.

4) The Income Generation Program (IGP) and Quality of Life Improvement Program (QLIP) are also being implemented through a number of CLCs operated by government in collaboration with NGO, GO, and IGO in all the district of Pakistan.

All the following activities are part of CLCs- program in one form or another:
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>#</th>
<th>Lesson, Training, Activities at CLC</th>
<th>Please tick!</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Literacy</td>
<td>√</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Post literacy</td>
<td>√</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Non formal Basic Education</td>
<td>√</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Technical, Vocational, Income generation</td>
<td>√</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Early Childhood Care and Education</td>
<td>√</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Equivalency Programme (Primary)</td>
<td>√</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Equivalency Programme (Lower/junior secondary)</td>
<td>√</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Equivalency Programme (Secondary)</td>
<td>√</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Community dialogue and meeting</td>
<td>√</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Others ( secondary ; Life Skills )</td>
<td>√</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2 Quality Assurance of programme delivery:

One of the most serious problems with education in Pakistan is its quality. Quality is mostly defined in terms of learners learning and outcomes of the course. Quality assurance can result in independent learning of learners.

Minimum standard for literacy skill is to be able to read and write a paragraph in any language with understanding and can make simple calculations. Also a learner may be able to practice her/his newly gained literacy skills in daily life and she/he may be able to express her feeling verbally as well as in writing. A learner may have better understanding of his surrounding, his rights/duties and skill to be engaged in income saving/earning activities.

Learners’ regular assessment on weekly, monthly basis is being undertaken by regular assessment programs to monitor learners’ progress for quality performance. Weekly and monthly targets are set in collaboration with the learners, teachers and literacy facilitator and then learners’ learning is judged/evaluated on weekly/monthly basis; thereby regularly assessing the progress of a CLCs.

Monitoring and evaluation of CLCs is also being carried out at the village level by the members of the village literacy committee. And at the institutional level by the implementing agency; sometimes monitoring and evaluation is carried out by the donor as well.
Special emphases are placed upon teachers’ training as they are the agents of change and play key role in promoting and inculcating literacy and life skills competencies and bringing positive attitudinal change in the society.

MIS system for effective management is also being developed by various government, semi government and non governmental organizations. Continuous learners’ evaluation program is introduced to ensure attainment of minimum learning competencies.

Since teachers play key roles in awareness raising, attitudinal improvement and in motivating and interest raising activities; TOTs (Training of the trainers, on job training/guidance and refresher courses for the teachers are part of the CLC programs for ensuring improvement in quality.

3. Decentralization and Management of CLC

CLCs are managed and operated by community members; hence its management structure is decentralized. However CLC- programme is initiated and organized by literacy section organizational structure of which is as under:

Organizational Set-up: Literacy

At the federal level, the earliest infrastructure came in the form of the LAMEC (Literacy & Mass Education Commission) in the year 1981. It was later renamed NETCOM (National Education & Training Commission) and then PMLC (Prime Minister’s Literacy Commission). It was then changed into PLC (Pakistan Literacy Commission), which was further renamed as Projects Wing, which is headed by a Joint Educational Advisor.

NCHD (National Commission for Human Development) has also been set up as an autonomous body which is operating in all the four provinces, FATA, FANA and AJK in the field of Universal primary education (UPE), Literacy and Health.

Provincial/Regional level

The implementation of literacy and non-formal education programmes is carried out by the provincial education and literacy departments (the counter parts of Federal Ministry of Education). Planning of literacy programmes at provincial level is the responsibility of Planning and Development Departments (in case of Punjab, Punjab Planning Commission).

Each Province has different administrative/ management structure for implementation of adult learning and literacy programmes which is as follows:

Punjab Province:

Punjab is the only Province which has separate Literacy and Non-formal Education Department headed by Minister. The Chief Executive of literacy department is the Secretary Literacy and Non-formal Education. The other officers include additional Secretary, Deputy Secretaries, Deputy Directors and
Assistant Directors etc etc. Executive District Officer (EDO) Literacy is the Chief Executive of literacy and non-formal education programmes at district level.

**Sindh Province:**

Literacy and non-formal education programmes are implemented in Sindh by the Education Department. For the purpose Sindh Province has set up Directorate of Literacy and Non-formal Education at Provincial level. Whereas, at district level they have District Literacy Officer (DO Literacy) except in one district i.e. district Karachi where they have EDO literacy.

**Khyber Pukhtoon Khawa (KP) Province:**

Literacy programmes in KP are implemented by Education Department (Directorate of School and Literacy.). They have District Literacy Officers at district level who work under Executive District Officer (EDO) Education. However, the main implementer/stakeholder of literacy programmes in KP is Elementary Education Foundation (EEF) set up and sponsored by KP Government.

**Balochistan Province:**

The literacy and non-formal education programmes in Balochistan Province are implemented by Social Welfare Department. They have a separate directorate i.e. Directorate of Literacy and Non-formal Education at Provincial level which implements and coordinates literacy and non-formal education programmes. The department/directorate have counter parts at district level.

**ICT and NFE**

ICT tools can improve the overall effectiveness of monitoring and evaluation; ICT can be used to facilitate the process of networking among organizations engaged in the design and delivery of NFE programs and enhance coordination of activities. ICT can facilitate documentation and information sharing.

Pakistan's Government is quickly realizing the importance of using technology to keep up with the rest of the world and is promoting its use specifically in the education sector. In Pakistan, ICT based literacy kit has been developed. The kit includes software to facilitate an illiterate person to be literate thought interactive learning with attractive audio and visuals. The kit will be piloted at literacy ICT centers in urban and semi-urban areas. The idea is to make use of digital technology in making lessons more interesting and provide an additional skill to the learner to improve his/her way of life.

1. **Literacy Survey and Assessment**

Assessment of actual competence of the population in literacy skills is important not only for measuring the human resource development in a society; such a data also offers feedback on the efficiency and effectiveness of the formal education system in a country. Information about ‘actual’ rate of literacy provides guidance to the planners of formal education system also for designing future interventions on quality of teaching-learning in the schools. UNESCO plans to
support a survey for assessing actual levels of literacy in Pakistan, through evidence based field research. Last date for receipt of proposals for the survey was 22 April 2011.

However like other developing countries, the main source of literacy data in Pakistan is the population census, which is usually conducted after every 10 years. Population Census is a grand exercise and in most of the cases, data on literacy is collected through oral responses of the people, and not supplemented or scrutinized through physical verification.

Recently, Statistics Division in Pakistan has started conducting sample surveys called Pakistan Social and Living Standard Measurement (PSLM) Surveys. Apart from information on various social indicators, data on literacy level of respondents is also collected through surveys. However, in these PSLM Surveys also, reliance is on the verbal information provided by the respondents, and no verification of the self claimed or self reported status of literacy is carried out. Information about set of minimum literacy skills which must be possessed by a (technically) ‘literate’ person is not adequately disseminated by the governments and relevant institutions.

2. Issues and challenges

1. Although a number of literacy program and CLCs are in operation both in Government and private sector; yet such initiatives are often time- and budget-bound projects without systematic or long-term strategies that actually link with education policy and planning.

2. Community people’s awareness about importance of education is still low while the government personnel have low recognition about NFE and CLCs.

3. Lack of resources in terms of materials and funds as well as capable personnel is the major constraint of the CLCs. At the same time, local resources have not been fully utilized by the CLCs before seeking assistance from outside.

4. Adult literacy has suffered primarily due to low rates of participation because of poverty and conservatism.

5. Furthermore, there are other causes of low literacy rates/participation including: financial constraints, lack of political will, absence of organizational structure, lack of capacity in literacy personnel and weak management especially monitoring and evaluation.

Annex 1:

“Khwendo Kor” CLCs Program: A Case Study

Khwendo Kor (meaning- Sisters’ Home, a non government non partisan and non profit organization established and registered in 1993 and works throughout KP and FATA) believes that low literacy level coupled with high drop out rate particularly in the villages of KP and FATA require combined efforts of all stake holders including both government and civil society. Hence it works to complement government efforts towards literacy for all by its community based primary
and middle schools’ program and by arranging community learning centers (CLCs) in FATA and rural areas of districts Bannu, Karak, Peshawar, Khyber agency, FR Bannu and FR Peshawar; whereas KK working areas are Peshawar, Mansehra, Karak, D.I. Khan, Upper Dir, Lower Dir, Bannu, Tank; FR Bannu, FR Peshawar, Bajour and Khyber agency.

At the beginning two CLCs were opened at Jamrud Khyber in 2009 with the overall aim to empower women and children of the area by enhancing their literacy and educational level.

The following were the characteristics of these CLCs:

1. It catered to (pre and post) literacy needs of women, adolescence, kids and dropouts simultaneously. The following 4-level of literacy courses were in operation in these CLCs:

   i. **Level-1** Section (A) illiterate adults (AL) and Section (B) Kids 3-5 yrs age children (ECE).
   ii. **Level-2** dropouts of class-1 to Class-3 (prepared to pass 3rd class exam within short span of time.)
   iii. **Level-3** dropouts of class-4 to Class-5 (prepared to pass 5th class exam within short span of time.)
   iv. **Level-4** dropouts of class-6 to Class-10 prepared to pass 10th class exam within short span of time.)

1. Introduction/induction of volunteers for promotion of literacy by providing monetary and other incentives and thus encouraging and motivating neo literates and literate women and girls of the area to work as a volunteer to impart literacy in their neighborhood at their free times. This had not only accelerated promotion of literacy by having multiplier effect on the process; but also provided a chance to the neo literates- volunteers to practice their newly gained skills that helped them to gain confidence.

   The idea was to encourage volunteerism by giving honorarium and cash prizes on the basis of the number of persons made literate by them. The aim was to generate multiplier effect thereby raising literacy level of the area to nearly 100% in a shortest span of time.

2. Provision of a small library facility equipped with diverse, interesting and practical reading material helped in enhancing learning level and developing reading habits among the learners, teachers and the volunteers alike.

3. Use of computers as a teaching tool was encouraged in the learning process.

4. Besides village Education Committee and “Village Coordination Forum” were formulated in the area for experience sharing and team working. Thus CLC also served as a meeting and information sharing place for women and provided them a forum for mutual collaboration, a forum for solving area problems on self help bases and an opportunity for combined efforts and for linkages development; serving as hub of activities for women of the area.
Inbuilt sustainability was the part of the Programme from the very beginning through strengthening VECs and women organizations and by mainstreaming the learners and by encouraging and promoting volunteers’ involvement in literacy on self help basis.

Strategies used were to impart basic literacy and enhance learners’ knowledge and competencies in three key subjects: Urdu, Arithmetic and English by building on learners already gained knowledge and by using quick learning methodologies and phonetic method of teaching the languages.

As a result of these CLCs learning level of the female of the area was enhanced; dropouts-adolescents of the area were mainstreamed through provision of concentrated courses and linkages development. These CLCs at Jamrud served a central place for activities like post literacy programme, linkages development, skill enhancement, supplementary reading facilities, sessions/meetings etc.

On the basis of experience thus gained KK operated 20 CLCs in FR Peshawar; after that another 10 were started in districts Peshawar, Karak and Khyber; and then 20 more are in operation in FR Bannu.

Bilqees Ismail,
Khwendo Kor,
Peshawar, Pakistan.