Regional Technical Workshop: National EFA 2015 Review  
20-22 November 2013, Bangkok, Thailand

Analytical Framework for  
the National EFA 2015 Reviews in Asia-Pacific  
(draft 13 November 2013)

1. EFA Review Framework

All Member States are invited to critically assess EFA progress and reflect on the future directions of education development beyond 2015. National EFA Reviews will involve conducting an exercise of three sequential components, such as:

**Component 1:** Stocktaking of progress towards EFA goals  
**Component 2:** Policy analysis of enablers and/or impediments to achieving EFA  
**Component 3:** Forward-looking discussion to define future challenges and priorities

The review framework is based on the following rationale:

*The Dakar Framework for Action provided the overall goal of education systems, stipulating that education should be “geared to tapping each individual’s talents and potential, and developing learners’ personalities, so that they can improve their lives and transform their societies.” (para 3). To this end, the international community committed to achieving the objective of providing quality education for all, by achieving greater access, equity and quality education by 2015 (para 7). The education policy review will then involve assessing how education system and institutions have been strengthened, reformed and mobilized to efficiently and effectively achieve the EFA goals (i.e. efficiency and effectiveness of education system performance at the system level and in the priority areas), including thorough review of critical success factors (means or building blocks for achieving the EFA goals).*

The review framework is outlined in below diagram:

![Diagram of EFA Review Framework]

**Goal:**  
Fulfilment of individuals’ potential for their decent life and work

**Objective:**  
Provision of quality education for all  
- Access  
- Quality  
- With Equity

**Means:**  
Building blocks  
Efficiency and effectiveness of determining factors
The stocktaking of the progress towards achieving EFA goals (component 1) will be done on a goal by goal basis, not only in terms of statistical presentation and analysis of progress towards providing quality education for all, but also assessment of relevance, efficiency and effectiveness of the programmes and initiatives employed by the country to achieve each of the following goals:

- Early Childhood Education and Care (ECCE)
- Universalization of primary education
- Learning and life skills for young people and adults
- Adult literacy
- Gender parity and equality
- Quality of education

Considering the obvious shortcomings at the global, regional and national levels in terms of disparities based on various factors of inequalities in access to education and in quality of learning, particular attention needs to be given in disaggregated assessment of data and information on EFA progress.

Component 2 of the review involves undertaking policy analysis on how or why the intended EFA goals have been achieved (or not achieved) by appraising the efficiency and effectiveness of the education sector, its policy planning and implementation aspects at the system level and in the policy domains that constitute the determinants for achieving the goals, such as: education policy, governance, finance, teaching and learning processes, curriculum, assessments and examinations, ICT in education, capacity of school leadership, stakeholder involvement, etc.

The above determining factors that constitute enablers or impediments towards achieving inclusive quality education (i.e. EFA) can be analysed by grouping them into clusters of policy domains, e.g. education policy and legal frameworks, sector management, school/classroom factors, and coordination and partnerships, whilst with necessary adaptation of scope and focus according to the national and local education development context.

The examples of the determinants or building blocks for education for all are presented in below diagram.
The education policy review takes stock of the achievements of the education system and its constituent institutions, their possible shortcomings in terms of efficiency and effectiveness of the education management system, and the bottlenecks impeding further educational development. The review will analyse the current status of the critical factors influencing the achievement of the EFA goals, especially how education policies and initiatives have been formulated, coordinated and monitored to support the educational development objective and relatedly how education institutions at central and subnational levels have been mobilized to achieve the quality education for all. The guiding questions that can be used to analyse the efficiency and effectiveness of education policy areas are presented in Section 2 below.

Component 3 of the review consists of devising possible policy directions for future education development based on past achievements and remaining shortcomings in the education sector and in light of the societal and developmental changes that have occurred over the past years. The Asia-Pacific region, like other parts of the world, has undergone rapid transformations over the past years, such as economic development with a growing number of middle income countries, changes in demographic dynamics, technological advances, as well as improving access across all levels of education. However, disparities among and within countries are still pervasive in all sectors, including access to schooling and quality of learning. These changes have implications for education, which need to be considered in shaping the future directions of educational development. A few examples of policy directions on how to best posit education in the on-going debate on the future of education development, as discussed in a series of expert meetings and stakeholder consultations organized by UNESCO Bangkok, may include the following:

- The future directions for education development and reform should be more clearly guided by the underlying principles of equity, human rights and sustainable development.
- Education should be relevant in tackling multi-facetted development challenges, such as governance, economic development, demographic dynamics, innovation, sustainability and peace.
- Quality learning for all, with explicit endeavour to narrow down disparities within and between countries, should be an overarching, umbrella agenda in most countries.
- Education reform should serve to guarantee equitable opportunities for all to participate in quality learning at all levels aiming to provide the knowledge, skills, competencies and values vital to achieve inclusive and sustainable development.
- Building learning communities is a dream within reach and education reforms should aim to transform schools into learning hubs as support for lifelong learning, which requires the education sector to engage and work with other sectors.

Different methods and techniques (or their combination) can be used to support forward-looking discussion on the future directions of education development, including focus group discussions, Logical Framework Approach, SWOT Analysis, policy simulation, feasibility study and/or stakeholder consultation.

2. Analysing the Education System

As outlined above, in order to carry out a systematic analysis of the functioning as well as the effectiveness and efficiency of the education system, we propose a conceptual framework that sees education system as consisting of numerous ‘building blocks.’ These building blocks in education can be clustered into four categories: i) policy and legal framework; ii) sector management; iii) school/classroom factors; and iv) coordination and partnerships. The framework assumes that the extent to which education systems can produce equitable quality learning for all depends on the ‘robustness’ of these, albeit intertwined, building blocks and how these blocks individually and collectively contribute to system effectiveness and efficiency.
The suggested guiding questions that can be used with necessary adaptation to analyse the above clusters of critical factors and depending on the national context and education development levels comprise the following:

2.1. Policy and Legal Framework

The policies, legal provisions and structures have an effect on educational outcomes. A country’s education policy and legal environment influences the government’s vision, priorities, strategies and institutional and legal mechanisms for achieving the objectives. It provides a framework within which decisions are made, resources allocated and citizens’ rights ensured.

Where policies and legal frameworks are not properly defined and misaligned or not guided by properly articulated visions, education systems can become dysfunctional. Possible guiding questions to examine each building block within this cluster are presented below:

**National Political Commitment**
- What is the evidence that there is strong and sustained national political commitment for educational development, including EFA?
- Has the country developed adequate national consensus on key educational priorities, directions and goals? Do all actors in the country have the same degree of commitment to improve the quality of education in all types of schools?
- To what extent has EFA been considered a priority in national policy and/or plan documents? To what extent do national education policies integrate commitments to achieve the EFA goals?

**Legislation**
- How effective are the constitutional and legal frameworks in terms of ensuring citizens’ right to education? To what extent is the right to education recognized and mentioned in the legislation, policies and public discourse in the country?
- What laws, policies, strategies, regulatory frameworks exist in the country to enhance the participation of excluded groups?
- What are the main obstacles to fully accomplish the right to education in the country?

**Policy and Planning Framework**
- How are education plans prepared? What process is involved in planning? How far local and/or non-state actors’ inputs are sought in the development of planning? What role do international development planners play in planning? How are the plans endorsed? How do different actors/agencies (ministry of education, ministry of finance, national planning authority) cooperate in preparing plans for quality education?
- What is the overall appropriateness of the current education sector policy/plan in terms of a) consistency with national development strategies, b) feasibility, c) comprehensiveness, d) relevance, e) presentation of clear indicators and targets, f) coverage, etc.?
- How well the agenda of EFA (access, quality, equity, diversity) is integrated into the national development plans, programmes and strategies of governments at different levels (national, sub-national and local)?
- Has the country developed national EFA plan? Does the EFA plan adopt a systemwide approach to education sector development? Is there an EFA-specific plan in addition to a sector-wide plan? Are there disconnects between national education plans and the country’s development needs and priorities?
**System Synergies and Complementarities**

- What are the mechanisms for ensuring that different levels of the education system are internally coherent, support each other and mutually reinforce each other? How do different levels/aspects of the education system internally cohere, support and mutually reinforce each other?
- What systems and arrangements are put in place and implemented to facilitate learners in making their choice in academic, career development and professional integration, e.g. quality assurance, career counseling and guidance, etc.?
- How are learners supported to benefit from alternative learning opportunities, including in non-formal education environment, taking into consideration their learning needs and capacities?

**Administrative Framework**

- How is the ministry of education (or ministries related to education) structured and staffed? Does the structure of the ministry of education provide for synergy? Does this structure and staffing allow for a smooth operation of the education sector?
- How are the various roles and responsibilities of administering educational affairs distributed across the different levels of administration from central to local level? How do governments at different levels share responsibilities in administering education programmes, including EFA related activities?
- What is the current level of decentralization/centralization of education administration? Are national, provincial and local bodies working in a coordinated manner to support schools, teachers and learners?

**Financing**

- What is the overall macro-economic context of the country and what are its implications for education financing? What is the share of the education budget for different education sub-sectors? How does the share of primary education compare to other education sub-sectors? Is there a policy to offset possible imbalance of resource allocations among education levels? Are there any financing gaps? What options are adopted to address the funding gaps?
- What is the role of different actors – the state (central government), provincial/local governments, and the non-public sector – in the financing of education in general and EFA in particular?
- What is the extent to which education funds are equitably distributed across geographical regions? Are resources targeted to support the excluded/disadvantaged groups with a view to reducing disparities?
- Does the country have right policies and strong governance structures to ensure that all available resources, whether raised domestically or from other sources, are used efficiently? What is the extent to which allocated funds are efficiently utilized? What are the main difficulties in using the allocated funds efficiently and effectively?
- What specific measures have been introduced to address the financial burden on the poor (such as abolition of school fees, scholarships and loan schemes) and how effective have they been?

**Governance and Accountability**

- What initiatives has the country introduced to promote the principles and values of good governance such as rule of law, participation, accountability, transparency, equity and flexibility in education?
• Is there an accountability system in place? What mechanisms are in place to hold public officials and institutions at all levels accountable for performance and outcomes? How effective are the accountability mechanisms? To what extent does the accountability system take account of quality and equity objectives? What sanctions are imposed if any specified outcomes and outputs are not delivered? Does the system work for all types of providers and actors at all levels?

• What recognized channels are there to allow the public to voice their opinions and concerns about the quality of education?

• What mechanisms and processes are in place to ensure financial accountability? How effective are these mechanisms for financial oversight? Are there ways of tracking expenditures? Is there wastage in public expenditure on education? What kind of misuse of resources has been observed? What mechanisms are in place to prevent the misuse and leakage of funds at all levels of educational management? Is there a transparent financial management system?

• In what ways do the various levels of governance share mutual accountability for results and learning outcomes? How are any unforeseen effects of accountability measures being addressed?

2.2 Sector Management

Education systems around the world have expanded greatly not only in size but also in their complexity of functions, task specialization, public expectations, and institutional diversity, etc. With the shift of educational responsibility to regional and local government bodies, to non-governmental organizations, and to the private sector in many countries, the management of the sector poses new challenges. Another key concern for most education systems is how to ensure that human and financial resources are used as efficiently and equitably as possible, especially in times of considerable resource constraints. Education sector performance depends on the overall national capacity to coordinate, lead and manage education sector. How effectively the capacity constraints are addressed will determine results. The building blocks under sector management can be examined with the help of following guiding questions:

**Human Resource Management (Teacher Management)**

• What is the overall situation of teacher supply, availability and distribution in the country? How does the existing teacher policy affect the supply and quality of teachers?

• What are the working conditions of teachers in terms of hours of work, class size, teaching aids and materials, school facilities and annual holidays and leave? What measures have been taken to enhance the working conditions?

• What is the overall status of teaching profession in the country? Does teaching attract the best and brightest?

• How does teacher salary compare to similar occupations in the country? What other benefits do teachers receive? Are there issues related to low teacher morale, commitment and accountability?

• What measures are taken to improve teacher professional development? What opportunities are available for teachers to be engaged in continuous professional development? How are teachers supervised and supported? What is overall teacher capacity in terms of using innovative teaching methods, manage diversity and create stimulating learning environments?
**Targeted Interventions**
- What current interventions in other sectors such as health, labor, social, legal services etc. have an impact on education development in general and marginalization and exclusion in particular?
- Does the country have any conditional or unconditional cash transfer programmes to support the poor households? What is the educational impact of such initiatives? How effective are such programmes in incentivizing educational participation?
- What other targeted interventions (e.g., girls’ scholarships, stipends, mid-day meal) has the country launched to support the participation of children and youth from poor households? How effective are these interventions?

**Assessment, Examinations and Monitoring & Evaluation**
- What is the overall national policy on educational assessment? What assessment systems are in place in the country? How well are assessments and examinations aligned to the goals of the curriculum and pedagogy?
- What is the extent to which different assessment, examination and M&E schemes fit together effectively in a coherent strategy for improving school outcomes and securing accountability?
- Has the country participated in any sub-regional, regional and international assessments? What is the impact of such external assessments?
- Has the country regularly assessed progress towards meeting EFA goals and targets? How effectively and regularly educational plans and programmes are monitored and evaluated?
- What mechanisms does the country have for using the evaluation and assessment results to inform education policy and practice (at classroom, school, regional and national level)?

**Information Management/EMIS**
- How is new knowledge produced, managed and used in education development?
- Are the policymakers and planners abreast of new trends, recent developments and innovations in education?
- Is there a functional Education Management Information System (EMIS) that supports policymaking, planning and monitoring related to EFA? What type of data does the EMIS collect? Is there proper balance between input, process and output/outcome related data? Does the EMIS collect data on both formal and non-formal education?
- Is there enough capacity in the country to produce accurate, reliable and timely data and indicators for feedback to policy-makers and practitioners?
- What are the gaps and/or bottlenecks for using data in education management, especially planning, programme implementation and M&E?

**Institutional Capacity**
- Does the country have adequate institutional capacity to plan, coordinate and implement and monitor education plans and programmes?
- Do the staff members working in the education sector at the national, provincial and local levels possess adequate expertise and experience in different technical, managerial and administrative fields of education?
- Does the country use national expertise and capacities in undertaking different activities (e.g., planning, project preparation, research, analytical work, monitoring and evaluation)?
- What is the gap, if any, in terms of management and analytical capacity of the education ministry and national institutions?
Policy Implementation

- How supportive are the demographic, economic, social, cultural and political environments under which country’s education policies and programmes are being implemented?
- Is there consistency between policy and the interventions? Do the interventions meet the needs of the target populations? Are they reaching the intended target populations with the appropriate services, at the planned rate?
- Do the implementing agencies (e.g. departments, regional/provincial and local authorities) have the capacity and resources that are needed to implement the policies? Is funding sufficient to meet the requirements? Does it arrive on time? Are the right staffing numbers and skills available? Are necessary services available in adequate supply?
- What is the level of policy and programmatic awareness among the implementers? Have there been systematic efforts to disseminate the policy?
- How effectively are educational policies implemented for quality education? How do authorities know that policies are implemented? What is the evidence of overall effectiveness of policy implementation?

2.3. School/Classroom Level Factors

The factors associated with conditions in schools and classroom processes make a difference in learning achievement of students. There is an increasing body of research evidence on school effectiveness that suggests that a number of school and classroom factors are associated with learning achievement of children. OECD’s analysis of PISA results shows a positive association between school and classroom factors and student learning. Some of these factors and possible guiding questions for review are provided below:

Curriculum

- How participatory and inclusive are the processes of curriculum development? How are different education stakeholders (teachers, learners, private sector, civil society) involved in developing the curriculum vision and appropriate curriculum policies? What is the mechanism for engaging and promoting participation of stakeholders from inside and outside the education system in the identification and prioritization of desired learning outcomes?
- Is the curriculum relevant to the needs of society and economy? Is it inclusive enough to represent and reflect the needs and aspirations of all learners? Does the curriculum allow timely adjustments to address global and local needs and developments?
- Does the curriculum support the learning of creativity and innovation skills, problem solving and critical thinking skills, communication and collaboration skills, information, media and technology skills and other life skills that are believed to be useful in the 21st century? Does the curriculum integrate principles and values of education for sustainable development?
- What is the evidence that the curriculum is implemented as planned in all schools? Are there gaps between intended and actual curriculum? What is the role of schools and teachers in curriculum development and implementation?
- Are teaching methods and assessment aligned to curricular aims and promoting learning?

Pedagogy

- What pedagogical practices are most common in classrooms? What are the key features of these pedagogical practices? How effective are pedagogical practices in terms of supporting learning and enabling learners to acquire expected competencies?
- Are children equitably exposed to effective pedagogical practices? Who are likely to be disadvantaged in terms of being exposed to effective pedagogical practices? What remedial support is available to learners who need additional and differentiated support?
What resources and facilities are available to teachers to support effective teaching? What are the challenges in terms of introducing modern and effective pedagogical practices?

Learning Environment
- Are there clearly articulated policy guidelines and legal frameworks designed to create an enabling learning environment in schools? How effective are these guidelines and instruments in ensuring enabling learning environments? Do they support a rights-based approach to education (the principles of availability and accessibility for all, non-discrimination, equality of opportunity, fundamental freedoms)?
- What concrete measures have been taken to address discrimination and to address/promote diversity and living and learning together? Are there systems to protect children from corporal punishment, bullying, sexual and physical abuse, neglect and exploitation or any other maltreatment?
- Are schools adequately resourced with all the basic services, physical resources and instructional materials for teaching/learning to take place?
- What concrete measures have been taken to ensure that learning places are safe, inclusive, and child-friendly, especially for girls and women and learners with disabilities? What is the extent to which learning environments support learning for all?

School Leadership
- How effective are the existing mechanisms for recruiting and selecting school heads in terms of proactively identifying strong and competent educational leaders? Is there a competitive and transparent recruitment system in place?
- How effective are existing leadership development programmes in terms of helping school heads develop and improve leadership competencies needed for quality improvement?
- How competent are school heads in exercising instructional leadership for quality education? What administrative, financial, instructional and supervisory functions do they perform that support quality learning in schools? Are there any barriers or constraints that undermine their authority? How is the system supporting heads in addressing these barriers?
- How effective are the school heads in mobilizing the support and cooperation of local stakeholders (e.g. school councils or management committees, parent-teacher associations, parent groups, NGOs, local governments and community members) for quality education?

Technology in Education
- What is the overall availability of ICTs in the country? Are there national policies that promote the use of ICTs in education? What is the level of awareness and understanding among policy-makers and education managers about different ICT options for use in different education settings? What is the extent to which ICTs have been harnessed to support EFA goals?
- What kinds of training and professional development activities are available to teachers who wish to use ICT effectively in improving their teaching and learning? What is the level of teachers in using ICT to develop teaching and learning materials and integrate ICT with their pedagogies? Are there disparities in this aspect between schools of different locations?
- To what extent and how well are ICTs being integrated into teaching and learning to achieve desired learning outcomes? How has the introduction of ICTs improved the quality of teaching and learning?

Hygiene and Sanitation
- What physical conditions exist in schools that may impact the health issues of concern (e.g. access to clean drinking water, proper sanitation facilities, lighting, ventilation and heating,
drainage and dampness)? Do the public schools have separate provision of sanitation facilities for girls and boys?

- Is there a national policy/plan/framework in regard to health and nutrition in schools? If so, what aspects (e.g. school health, HIV and AIDS, malaria, deworming, school feeding, etc.) does it cover? How effective is the implementation? To what extent educational and health authorities cooperate to improve health conditions of children in schools? Which specific health and nutrition issues merit more specific policies/plans/frameworks?

- What is being done to promote hygiene behavior/practices among children, teachers and schools? How do hygiene and sanitary conditions and practices impact learning in schools?

2.4. Coordination and Partnerships

Quality education is a collective responsibility requiring collective efforts. Since education functions are distributed within and outside the education sector, coordination and partnerships become vital in ensuring that all concerned work in unison to achieve quality education.

Increasingly, a number of non-state actors such as businesses/private sector, NGOs, civil society organizations, faith-based organizations and foundations are involved in the delivery of education. Partnerships with the non-state sector can contribute to quest for quality education. A sound public-private partnership strengthens public sector performance and implementation of education policies, enhances equity, efficiency and effectiveness and reduces both duplication and gaps in education services. Evidence also suggests that partnerships are also essential to promote innovation and enhance the role of non-state actors in delivering education services without which governments alone would not be able to do it.

Some guiding questions to examine the building blocks in this category are as follows:

**Parental and Community Involvement**

- What is the overall role of parents, families, local communities or local organizations in supporting EFA and learning? How effective are the structures created at the school level (e.g. PTA) in allowing teachers and parents work together to improve student learning?
- How does parental participation in school activities support quality learning? What decisions parents are taking in improving quality learning? Is there any role in decision-making?
- How does the involvement of local community members, local political bodies, NGOs, local media or other stakeholders support quality learning in schools? How effective are the school management boards/committees in ensuring effective school management?
- In what ways do school heads and teachers work with parents and communities in addressing school development and learning issues?

**Sectoral/Inter-sectoral Coordination**

- How do different institutions and actors at national, provincial and local levels within and outside the sector function and interact with each other in delivering the education services in a coordinated manner?
- Are educational functions distributed across the different ministries? In contexts where several ministries are involved in education (e.g., ECCE and TVET), how do these ministries work and coordinate together? How are education priorities and budget proposals prepared by MOEs accommodated/respected by finance ministries and planning bodies?
- What is the extent of information sharing, consultation and joint work with various line ministries and other key stakeholders, especially education, planning bodies, finance ministries and development partners? How effective are the inter-sectoral and intra-sectoral coordination arrangements and how effective are these mechanisms? To what extent was the
MOE able to ensure coordination, complementarity and synergies with other line ministries, NGOs and other stakeholders in the country?

- What arrangements have been made between the central and decentralized bodies to ensure coordination?
- Has the country established a national EFA forum? How effective has this mechanism been in providing a platform for EFA actors and stakeholders? What other coordination mechanisms are in place in the country to ensure coordination amongst the various actors and stakeholders at different levels? How effective are these mechanisms?

**Donor Coordination** (if the country is a recipient of external aid)

- What is the aid architecture like in the country? What is the extent to which the government and donors are committed to the Principles of Paris Declaration?
- Who are the major development partners in the country supporting education sector, in particular EFA? What is the role of external donors in the financing of education of the country in question? What are the priority areas of their interventions, funding resources, the extent and duration of their involvement, and the aid modalities used?
- What is the status of donor harmonization and alignment in the country? What donor co-ordination mechanisms are in place? How effective are these mechanisms?
- How are the modalities of external aid to education sector changing over time?

**Involvement of the Non-State Sector/Partnerships**

- What are the various forms of partnerships between the non-state actors and the government in the provision of quality education? Who are the actors in the non-state sector? What have been their respective roles? What is the scale of involvement in education?
- What is the role of the government in leading, regulating, supporting and coordinating non-state sector involvement? How appropriate is the country’s policy framework in guiding and governing the involvement of non-state sector, including public-private partnerships? How do different actors and types of institutions function and interact with each other in achieving EFA goals?
- What are the main risks to quality and equity in education due to partnerships with non-state actors? How are these risks being addressed? How effective is the existing regulatory framework in regulating education institutions in the non-state sector to ensure minimum quality and value for money to the learners?
- How does the involvement of non-state actors contribute to enhancing quality and innovation? What is the evidence that the partnership has enhanced quality and innovation? Is there a sense of shared commitment to mutual accountability between government and the non-state sector? What are the lessons learned and good practices?
- Does the government have a programme to develop the capacity of civil society organizations? How effective are the programmes designed to build the capacity of civil society organizations, social partners and other stakeholders for quality education?

**South-South Cooperation**

- Is your country participating in any international, regional and sub-regional education cooperation frameworks, networks, forums or initiatives (e.g., analytic forms of cooperation designed to create and share knowledge; benchmarking and education system comparison initiatives; ministerial forums, etc.)? What are the various types of cooperation modalities in which the country is participating? What objectives do these frameworks seek to accomplish? (knowledge sharing, capacity development, benchmarking)
• How is your country’s education system benefitting from different types of triangular and South-South Cooperation? How are these activities changing educational priorities and policies in your country?

• What role if any have private sector and CSOs played in international, regional or sub-regional education cooperation?

• What can be done to make ODA more effective?

**ODA (For Donor Countries)**

• What is your country’s total ODA to education as a whole? What is the distribution of ODA across the different sub-sectors? What is the share of bi-lateral and multilateral assistance? Who are the countries benefitting from your country’s ODA in the region and elsewhere?

• What are the various forms/modalities of technical cooperation through which your country supports education development in developing countries? Which countries in the region and elsewhere have benefitted from technical assistance provided by your country?

• What is the overall impact of ODA on educational development in general and attainment of EFA goals in particular?

• What are the challenges in effectively utilizing ODA for education development? What can be done to make ODA more effective in education development?