EFA 2015 Review - ANNEX A: Indicators for National Reports and examples of education disparities in Asia-Pacific
Presentation Outline

• Introducing Annex A: EFA 2015 Review Indicators

• Examples of Indicators and Disaggregated Reporting

• Expectations and Support to Countries for Completing Annex A
I. Introducing Annex A: EFA 2015 Review Indicators
Lessons Learnt on Data from EFA Mid Decade Assessment

• Life Skills had the weakest data as a Goal. Countries did not include details in their Nat’l MDA Reports or data sets

• Very weak data in region related to Water & Sanitation in schools

• Very poor data on learning achievement. Lack of willingness to share results from national examinations and no regional metric

• Amongst hard to reach - Disabilities were weakest, followed by ethnic minorities - in terms of lack of data. Some countries could report on the Poor’s education status via Census or regular Surveys

• Data was often available but ability to analyze and use data for advocacy or policy decision making was still weak
Annex A: Indicators for EFA 2015 Review

- This is approved as **Optional Protocol** by the Regional EFA Thematic Working Group (EFA TWG). Countries not required to submit disaggregated Data or can send partial data. **Total # of indicators is 50.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Goal</th>
<th># of Indicators</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>#1 - ECCE</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#2 - Primary Ed</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#3 - Life Skills</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#4 - Literacy</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#5 - Gender</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#6 - Quality</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Purpose of Annex A

- Asia-Pacific countries have vastly improved EMIS capacity over the past 15 years. Showcase good regional examples through EFA 2015 Review
- Time series data – including sub-national trends, should be possible in many cases
- Across the region – there are common disparities and shared issues in education exclusion. The Review will help identify these disparities as a basis for building South-South Cooperation in response
- Not for National Tables of national averages – but to compare types and levels of educational disparity
- Capacity building on data preparation, use and analysis for specific countries is possible
II. Examples of Indictors and Disaggregated Reporting
Analysis of disparity on EFA progress examined 4 main drivers of inequity in the region

1. **Poverty** – economic quintiles
2. **Geographical location**
3. **Gender** differences in achievement of MDGs
4. Others drivers: **ethnicity, language, religion, disabilities.**
Disparities in Net Attendance Rates: Primary - and - Secondary

- Bangladesh (81%)
- Cambodia (77%)
- India (72%)
- Indonesia (85%)
- Lao PDR (79%)
- Mongolia (95%)
- Nepal (87%)
- Pakistan (66%)
- Thailand (98%)
- Vanuatu (80%)
- Viet Nam (95%)

Male - Female
Urban - Rural
Best - Worst Area
Richest - Poorest
(National Average)

- Bangladesh (39%)
- Cambodia (28%)
- India (51%)
- Indonesia (58%)
- Lao PDR (36%)
- Mongolia (85%)
- Nepal (47%)
- Pakistan (27%)
- Thailand (80%)
- Vanuatu (46%)
- Viet Nam (79%)

Male - Female
Urban - Rural
Best - Worst Area
Richest - Poorest
(National Average)
EFA Goal 1 - Expand early childhood care and education (ECCE)

Key Indicators

1. GER in Early Childhood Care and Education (ECCE) programs
2. Per cent of New Entrants to Primary Grade 1 who have attended some form of Organized ECCE programs
3. Private Centre Enrolment as percentage of total enrolment in ECCE programs
4. Per cent of Under-Fives Suffering from Stunting
5. Per cent of Household Consuming Iodized salt
6. Per cent of trained teachers in ECCE programs
7. Public expenditure on ECCE programs as percentage of total public expenditure on Education
Gross enrolment ratio (GER) in Early Childhood Care and Education (ECCE) programmes
Indonesia

Source: Indonesia EFA MDA dataset
Relationships between NER in Primary and % of Iodized Salt Consumption, Mongolia and Thailand, 2005-2006

Source: MICS 2005-2006 (Thailand and Mongolia)
Goal 2 - Provide free and compulsory primary education for all

Key Indicators

8. GIR in Primary Education
9. NIR in Primary Education
10. GER in Primary Education
11. NER in Primary in Education*
12. Dropout rate
13. Repetition Rate by grade in Primary Education
14. Survival rate to grade 5*
15. Transition rate by Grade

* Indicates MDG indicator
Enrolment by Year and Age Status
Vanuatu, 2011
Source: Vanuatu, EMIS, 2012

- Under-Age
- Official Age
- Over-Age
Enrolment by Year and Age Status
Vanuatu, 2011

Source: Vanuatu, EMIS, 2012

Enrolment by Year and Age Status
Vanuatu, 2011

Source: Vanuatu, EMIS, 2012

%Under-Age  %Official Age  %Over-Age

ECE  Year 1  Year 2  Year 3  Year 4  Year 5  Year 6  Year 7  Year 8  Year 9  Year 10  Year 11  Year 12  Year 13  Year 14
Over-Age Enrolment by Year
Vanuatu, 2011
Source: Vanuatu, EMIS, 2012

%Over-Age 1yr
%Over-Age 2 yrs+
NER Primary vs % of Respondents with no Education
Timor-Leste, 2009-2010

% of respondents with no education

y = -0.8371x + 98.516
R² = 0.5139

Source: Timor-Leste DHS 2009-2010

Somewhat – significant correlation

Percent distribution of the de facto female household populations age 6 and over by highest level of schooling attended or completed and median grade completed, according to background characteristics, Timor-Leste 2009-10
6-11 Year Olds: School Attendance Rate by district and Number Not Attending by province, 2008

Source: Census 2008
Gross Enrolment VS Net Enrolment Rate in Primary, Selected countries, 1999-2011

Source: UIS Online Database
http://www.uis.unesco.org/Pages/default.aspx
Gross enrolment ratio (GER) in primary education
sub-national disparities

Source:
KHM_EMIS office, Planning Department
MMR_DEPT and DBEs
Lao PDR_National EFA MDA, 2007
IDN_MoNE Schools Only
MYS_MOE, Pendidikan Islam, JPS
Goal 3 – Promote learning, skills for young people and adults

Key Indicators

16. GER in Secondary Education
17. NER in Secondary Education
18. Youth Literacy Rate (15-24 years)*
19. GER in Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) by vocation program
20. Technical Vocation Education and training teachers classified by qualification
21. Designated curriculum time in Education system to develop children and young people’s knowledge, skills, and attitude for health (ISCED) from curriculum development center (MoE)
22. Transition rate between primary and secondary to higher education system.
23. Participation rate of young people and adults in accredited, NFE programmes

* Indicates MDG indicator
Youth and Adult Literacy Rates, 2004-2006

Source: Global Monitoring Report, 2010

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cambodia</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indonesia</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Malaysia</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pakistan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sri Lanka</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Gross Enrollment Ratio in Lower Secondary Education 2000-2006
Whole Kingdom, Urban, Rural, Remote Areas

Reference 100%

Inequality Increase

Inequality Increase


Percent

Cambodia
Urban
Rural
Remote

0 25 50 75 100
Goal 4 – Increase adult literacy by 50 per cent

Key Indicators

24. Adult literacy rate (15 years and above)
25. Youth Literacy Rate (15-24 years)
26. Gender Parity Index for Adult Literacy
27. Public expenditure on Literacy and NFE as a percentage of total public expenditure on education
Tested Functional Literacy
Lao PDR by Ethnicity, 2001

Female 15-59 yr Tai-Kadai: 40.1%
Male 15-59 yr Tai-Kadai: 55.9%
16% difference

Female 15-59 yr Austroasiatic: 22.7%
Male 15-59 yr Austroasiatic: 36%
13% difference

Female 15-59 yr Sino-Tibetan: 16.3%
Male 15-59 yr Sino-Tibetan: 26.4%
10% difference

Female 15-59 yr Hmong-Yao: 11.9%
Male 15-59 yr Hmong-Yao: 38.5%
27% difference

Source: Lao Literacy Survey
Literacy rate of 15-19 year olds by Ethnic group, Malaysia, 1970-2000

Source: Malaysia Achieving the Millenium Development Goals, Economic Planning Unit, Prime Minister's Department, Malaysia, 2005, P. 70
Goal 5 – Achieve gender parity by 2005, gender equality by 2015

Key Indicators

28. GPI for Literacy
29. GPI for GER/NER in ECCE
30. GPI for GIR/NIR in Primary Education
31. GPI for GER/NER in Primary Education
32. GPI for GIR/NIR in Secondary Education
33. GPI for GER/NER in Secondary Education
34. GPI for Survival rate to grade 5
35. GPI for Transition rate to Secondary Education
36. % of Female enrolment in primary education, secondary education, TVET
37. % of Female teachers in primary education, secondary education, TVET
38. % of repetition of girls and boys in primary and secondary levels
39. Number of education officers in management position by gender
40. Proportion of male and female participating in school management
Gender Parity in Gross Enrolment Ratio in Secondary Education, East Asia

Source: UNESCO EFA GMR 2008
Gender Parity in Net Enrolment Ratio in Secondary Education
Myanmar, 2005-2008

Source: Myanmar provisional EFA MDA dataset
Gender parity in net enrolment ratio in secondary education

Mekong Sub-Region

Source: EFA GMR 2008
Viet Nam
Net attendance ratio of female children of secondary school age attending secondary or higher school
Net Enrolment Rate, Primary, gender disparity
Lao PDR vs East Asia and the Pacific, 1999-2011

Gradual improvement

Net Enrolment Rate (%)


Source: UIS Online Database: http://www.uis.unesco.org/Pages/default.aspx

Net Enrolment Rate, Primary, gender disparity
Mongolia vs East Asia and the Pacific, 1999-2011

Reverse trend!

Net Enrolment Rate (%)


Source: UIS Online Database: http://www.uis.unesco.org/Pages/default.aspx
% of Female/Male Enrolment, by Level
Vanuatu, 2011

- **ECE**
- **Primary**
- **Secondary**

**Female**

- **Vanuatu**
- **Torba**
- **Tafea**
- **Shefa**
- **Sanma**
- **Penama**
- **Malampa**

**Male**

- **Vanuatu**
- **Torba**
- **Tafea**
- **Shefa**
- **Sanma**
- **Penama**
- **Malampa**
Goal 6: Improve the quality of education

Key Indicators

40. Percentage of Primary school teachers having the required academic qualification
41. Percentage of school teachers who are certified to teach according to National standards for ECCE, Primary, secondary, NFE
42. Pupil-Teacher Ratio (PTR) for primary education and secondary education
43. Pupil-Class ratio (PCR) for primary education and secondary education
44. Pupil-Textbook ratio (PBR) for primary education and secondary education
45. Public expenditure on education as per cent of total government expenditure
46. Public expenditure on education as per cent of Gross National Product (GNP)
47. Public expenditure on Primary and Secondary education per pupil as Per cent of GNP per capita
48. Percentage of schools with improved drinking water sources
49. Percentage of schools with adequate sanitation facilities
50. National Examination results
Literacy Achievement by Language Group, Cook Islands

Source: Country report, Regional Meeting of National EFA Coordinator, Cook Islands, 2010

- **CI Maori Below standard**
- **CI Maori At/Above standard**
- **English Below standard**
- **English At/Above standard**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Rarotonga</th>
<th>Southern Group</th>
<th>Northern Group</th>
<th>National</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2007</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2009</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Primary Education Pupil-Teacher Ratio by qualification
Vanuatu, 2007

- Pupil-certified teacher ratio
- Pupil-qualified teacher ratio
- Pupil-teacher ratio (PTR)

Source: Vanuatu, MEYDT, Digest of Education Statistics, 2007
III. Expectations and Support to Countries for Completing Annex A
Expectations

- UNESCO APPEAL/UNICEF EAPRO will prepare Templates – for each Indicator – with generic definition and space for Countries to include “National Definitions”

- UNESCO APPEAL/UNICEF EAPRO will prepare Templates – for each Country by Indicator – with sub-national areas included. Please give feedback on these areas over the next 2 days.

- Countries complete uploading data onto Templates only for those Indicators which are closely related to existing EMIS or other existing data sources. No new data collection.
Expectations (cont’d)

• Time Series data – where possible – is requested
• Countries can make specific requests to UNESCO APPEAL/UNICEF EAPRO for technical support and capacity development
• UNESCO APPEAL/UNICEF EAPRO will upload all data into regional EFAInfo database – and carry out analysis for EFA 2015 Regional Report
Support Available

• Guidelines (developed after EFA MDA) are available to countries

• Templates in Excel format will be made available to all countries - customized with sub-national areas for easier uploading of data

• Visits by technical experts to support data preparation and analysis can be requested

• Funding – modest amounts to country teams as reimbursement for additional work load of preparing tables and uploading data into Templates
For further information and details

Please contact:

• efa.bgk@unesco.org

And

• Ms. Malisa Santigul   - m.santigul@unesco.org

Or

• Ms. Tanaporn Perapate – tperapate@unicef.org
References


• *Global Monitoring Report*: Overcoming inequality: Gender and Education for All, The leap to equality, UNESCO (2003/4)


• In pursuit of equity in education using international indicators to compare equity policies, Hutmacher, W.; Cochrane, D.; Bottani, N. (Eds.) (2001)

• *Guidelines for EFA: Monitoring, Evaluation and Assessment*: Identifying and Reaching the Unreached, (UNESCO)

• *Systematic monitoring of Education for All*: Training modules for Asia-Pacific
Credits

Content of this presentation was contributed by

- Bertrand Tchatchoua (UIS-AIMS Unit, UNESCO Bangkok)
- Roshan Bajracharya (UIS-AIMS Unit, UNESCO Bangkok)
- Shiu-Kee Chu (Author of the training modules on Systematic Monitoring of EFA)
- Ushio Miura (EPR unit, UNESCO Bangkok)
- Cliff Meyers (UNICEF EAPRO)
- Tanaporn Perapate (UNICEF EAPRO)
Regional Technical Workshop: National EFA 2015 Reviews in Asia-Pacific
20-22 November 2013, Bangkok, Thailand

Thank you!